



2016

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee

LEGAL ACTION REPORT AND SUMMARY OF MINUTES
Thursday, February 11, 2016
4th Floor Conference Room, Joel D. Valdez Main Library,
101 N. Stone, Tucson, Arizona 85701

1. Call to Order / Roll Call

Meeting called to order at 12:00 p.m.

Commissioners: Teresita Majewski (Chair), Patsy Waterfall, Jim Sauer, Helen Erickson, Sharon Chadwick, Michael Becherer

Staff: Frank Dillon, Michael Taku, Alexandra Hines, Jonathan Mabry (PDSD)

2. Approval of Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes for 1-28-16

Motion by Commissioner Erickson to approve the Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes of 1-28-16. Motion seconded by Commissioner Waterfall.

Motion passed. Voice Vote 6-0.

3. Courtesy Review Cases

b. Himmel Park Library Entrance - Historic Landscape Improvement Design (Parks & Recreation)

Presentation by Joe O'Neill, from Department of Parks & Recreation. Commissioner Erickson, read the T-PCHC Landscape Subcommittee LAR into the record. The scope of the park beautification project is limited to the entrance of the library. Discussions included removal and use of sustainable plants; use of bricks and plant regrouping. The general remarks were on the use of decomposed granite not being typical of the

historic period of the park and proposed landscape would not have any significant negative impact on the overall park. Commissioner Erickson commended the group for the work.

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Waterfall, to recommend approval of the proposal as presented noting the use of brick instead of flagstone; if decomposed granite is used, appropriate color to be selected and referring to the T-PCHC Landscape Subcommittee LAR from January 19, 2016, for guidelines like plant groupings.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 6-0.

c. Tahoe Park - New Ramada, Interpretative displays and sidewalk/ADA access (Parks & Recreation)

Allison Hughes, from Catalina Vista Neighborhood, introduced the other team members present. The park project is a City and Neighborhood Association partnership. The tube-steel Ramada will not have seats and the proposed roof will be historic green tiles. The Interpretative displays will speak of the history of the area. Commissioners expressed concern for creating a false sense history with tiles; a new structure may be a distraction in the park and requested confirmation from SHPO that the structure would have “no adverse effect” on the historic park.

Commissioner Sauer inquired if the structure compromises the integrity of the historic park.

Don Ryden, from Ryden Architects, provided background of the historic nomination of the neighborhood.

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Waterfall, to recommend approval of the proposal as presented following consideration from the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) that the structure will not have adverse effect and to hold a an onsite T-PCHC Plans Review Subcommittee (PRS) meeting to review the proposal including evaluating possible negative effect on the historic park landscape

Motion carried. Voice Vote 6-0.

4. Infill Incentive District Review Cases

UDC Sections 5.12.6.E.2 & 5.12.10

- a. **IID-15-09** – Carhuff and Cueva Architects – The West Pointe Apartments – Proposed addition of mixed-use commercial and residential – 10 East Broadway (Westerner Building) (Downtown Core Subdistrict)

Commissioner Jim Sauer recused from the discussion and motion due to conflict of interest.

Staff Dillon introduced the project and provided handouts of the addendum proposal. The applicants, Philip Carhuff and Vance Goodman, from Carhuff & Cueva Architects, presented the proposal. The applicants explained that they have been working with Don Ryden, from Ryden Architects, on the historic portion of the project. Don Ryden and Philip Carhuff explained that they had been working with SHPO and received concurrence that the new addition would have “no adverse effect” on the historic building. Concurrence documentation was provided to Plans Review Subcommittee members as part of the project submittal.

It was moved by Commissioner Becherer, duly seconded by Commissioner Waterfall, to recommend approval of the concept proposal as presented noting that the T-PCHC Plans Review Subcommittee does not find that the addition would have an “adverse effect” to the district or the building and to return with any subsequent changes to the proposal.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 5-0.

5. Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases

UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines

Commissioner Sauer returned to deliberations.

- a. **HPZ-15-104** – Weinstein – Demolition of Three Accessory Structures – 1045 North 5th Avenue (West University)

Staff Taku read the summary from West University Historic Zone Advisory Board into the record.

The applicant, David Weinstein, presented the proposal.

Commissioner Sauer provided a summary of the site from a minor review of the main house where discussion for the three structures took place.

It was moved by Commissioner Waterfall, duly seconded by Commissioner Becherer, to recommend approval of the proposal and demolition as presented with the understanding that T-PCHC Plans Review Subcommittee will see a replacement plan of the stair prior to the demolition of the existing stair during an onsite minor review meeting.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 4-2.

- b. HPZ-16-02 – Owl's Club Office & Maternity Lounge Remodel – Tenant Improvement (TI): Offices, Windows & Lactation Room - 378 North Main Avenue (El Presidio)**

Staff Taku read the summary from El Presidio Historic Zone Advisory Board into the record.

David Shambach, from David E. Shambach Architects, presented the proposal and introduced Gus Glaser from the Owl's Club.

It was moved by Commissioner Becherer, duly seconded by Commissioner Waterfall, to recommend approval of the proposal as presented with the condition for all new windows be wood double hung.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 6-0.

6. Rio Nuevo Area Review Cases
UDC Section 5.12.7

- a. RNA-16-01 – Hotel Congress – Detached Accessory Structure (Masonry Storehouse – 311 East Congress Street (Rio Nuevo Area)**

Staff Taku introduced the proposal.

Marcellus Rusk, from Vint & Associates, presented the proposal.

Commissioners discussed the type and style of roof and materials for the doors. Commissioner Sauer inquired about the doors and roll doors.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Waterfall, to recommend approval of the proposal as presented with two clarifications: (1) prefinished standing seam roof, with 12" wide panel and 1" high rib and (2) steel doors with warm tones to complement the main structure (Hotel Congress).

Motion carried. Voice Vote 6-0.

- b. RNA-16-02 – Pueblo Vida Brewing Company – Storefront Modifications/New Windows/Glass Garage Door – Zoning Violation/Stop Work Order – 113-115 East Broadway Boulevard (Rio Nuevo Area)**

Staff Taku summarized the zoning violation and stop work order and the abatement process.

The applicant, Kyle Jefferson, from Pueblo Vida Brewing Co., provided background.

Staff Mabry noted that the recommendation can have two parts: if the submittal was complete and incomplete.

Commissioner Sauer observed that the opening of the transom is good, but removing the recess and installing the operable overhead doors; and operable window over counter are not good. Staff Mabry does not think the materials are historic, just the configuration. Commissioners expressed concerns with historic materials removed and the City lack of oversight on this property.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Becherer, to recommend that the applicant be required to provide drawings to show a facade that retained the recesses, and provided enough architectural detail so that the proposal could be properly evaluated; and return to PRS for review and action.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 6-0.

3. Courtesy Review Cases

- a. Potential Memorial in Veinte do Agosto Park (City Manager's Office)**

Commissioner Jim Sauer and Michael Becherer recused from the discussion and motion due to conflict of interest.

Elaine Becherer, from the City Manager's Office, presented the proposal. Discussion was on the existing memorial, location for the new memorial tree, missing trees and existing/new memorial plaque on site.

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Waterfall, to recommend approval of the proposal as presented.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 4-0.

7. Current Issues for Information/Discussion

Commissioner Sauer and Becherer returned to deliberations.

a. Minor Reviews

Staff Taku and Commissioner Erickson to conduct minor reviews on Friday.

b. Appeals

None at this time.

c. Zoning Violations

Staff continues to assist owners on abatement of violations in the City Historic Districts and Rio Nuevo Area.

d. Review Process for Approval of Complex Large-Scale and/or Multi-Phase Projects

Staff Hines informed the Commissioners that copy of the application and case information will be provided for each case packet as the introductory cover sheet. Staff Taku informed Commissioners that the UDC Section numbers are provided on the agenda and LAR for reference.

8. Call to the Audience

No one from the audience spoke at this time.

9. Future Items

Nothing at this time.

10. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 3:11 p.m.